

## REVIEW

From Prof. Rayna Nikolova, professor at New Bulgarian University and titular internal member of the scientific jury for the application of Assoc. Prof. Todor Panaiotov Kolarov, Dr. Habil. to the competition for the academic position of “Professor” in the higher education field: 3. Social, economic and legal studies in the professional field 3.6. Law (Civil Procedure Law) at New Bulgarian University

### 1. Applicant data related to educational and scientific degree “Ph.D.”

Assoc. Prof. Todor Panaiotov Kolarov, Dr. Habil. holds a Master’s Degree from Sofia University “Saint Kliment Ohridski”(1998). Master’s Degree in Law from Georgetown University in the U.S. through a full “Fulbright” Commission scholarship (2001).

### 2. Applicant data related to the academic position held

The candidate’s professional experience as a university teacher includes professional activities as an Assist. Prof. in EU Law at Plovdiv University (PU) “Paisii Hilendarski” (2012-2017) and guest lecturer, then Assoc. Prof. at Varna Free University (2011-2014). He has been holding the academic position of Assoc. Prof. at the NBU Law department since Nov.1, 2014.

### 3. Applicant data related to his activities as a specialist-practitioner that has established achievements in the professional field.

Assoc. Prof. Todor Panaiotov Kolarov, Dr. Habil. is an established specialist in legal and security studies. He is a consultant on confiscation of criminal assets and countering money laundering for the UN Office on Drugs and Crime (Afghanistan and Pakistan – 2017; Nigeria – 2016; Iran, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan and Turkmenistan – 2015) and the European Commission (EC) (UkraineУкрайна - 2019, Kyrgyzstan - 2018 and Croatia – 2012). Lecturer in international fora, organized by the UN Office on Drugs and Crime (Dushanbe – 2017; Abudja and Lagos – 2016; Almaty – 2015.), Dutch and Italian Presidencies of the Council of EU (Brussels – 2016 and Siracusa – 2014) and European Economic and Social Committee (Brussels – 2022).

His professional activities include appointment at the World Bank in Washington D.C. (2001-2003) and U.S. Department of Justice in Sofia (2004-2011). In 2010, as legal advisor at the U.S. Department of Justice he is a recipient of a personal award from the U.S. Attorney General Eric Holder. He acquires international experience at “White and Case” LLP in Washington (2001), World Trade Organization (WTO) in Geneva (2002) and European Commission in Brussels (2003). Chair of the Commission for the establishment of property acquired through criminal activities (2011-2012). Chair of the Regional anti-corruption

initiative, an international intergovernmental network with its seat in Bosnia and Herzegovina, which brings together 9 countries from South Eastern Europe (2018-2019).

The candidate has been an attorney-at-law and an international consultant: (a) since 2021, selected by the Council of Europe in a pool of 10 experts in the thematic categories: (i) anticorruption (ii) money laundering and confiscation and (b) since 2020 selected by CEPOL in thematic categories: (i) higher education and research; (ii) anti-corruption and (iii) countering money laundering.

#### 4. Data on the published monograph and its scientific contributions

4.1. The monograph “Procedural substitution in civil“, Sofia: Ciela, 2023, ISBN: 978-954-28-4420-4 consists of 246 pages. It has 257 footnotes and references to 93 scientific publications (monographs, studies and articles), of which in Bulgarian (66), English (13), Russian (5), German (4), Italian (3), Spanish (1) and Romanian (1). Rich judicial practice is a basis of the scientific study: Ruling of the Plenary of the Supreme Court in the period 1965 – 1980 (3); Interpretative Decisions of the General Assembly of the Civil Chamber of Supreme Court of Cassation in the period 2013 – 2020 (9); Decisions of the Supreme Court of Cassation (36); Court Orders of the Supreme Court of Cassation (16); Decision of Plovdiv Court of Appeal; 3 decisions and one court order of Sofia City Court. It is structured in five chapters, conclusion and bibliography.

There is no introduction in the monograph.

Chapter one ”General characteristic of procedural substitution”, in its first part, makes a retrospective analysis of the appearance of “procedural substitution”. It is a comprehensive review of the innate characteristics of procedural substitution and underscores the features outlined in the theory, namely that the procedural substitute holds the procedural right to initiate civil procedure, acting independently from the real party in interest and even contrary to its will in exercising and disposal of its procedural rights even though it acts to protect foreign substantive right and the legal consequences of this affect the real party in interest.

Chapter two of the monograph “Distinction between procedural substitution and other legal institutes. Controversial hypotheses.” Presents a comparative study of procedural substitution, procedural representation, succession in the proceedings, impleaded party and intervenors as well as other party joinder.

Chapter three “Types of procedural substitution” focuses on four classification criteria – depending on whether the real party in interest is a party in the proceedings; depending on court proceedings; depending on whether procedural substitution is the active or the passive party in the proceedings and depending on whether individual or collective interest is defended.

Chapter four „Prerequisites for admissibility of procedural substitution (art. 26, para. 2 CPC). Realization of the defense in procedural substitution” discusses peculiarities in realization of procedural substitution in with respect to admissibility and on its merits.

Chapter five “Legal consequences of procedural substitution” is devoted to the legal consequences of procedural substitution for the subjective and objective limits of *res iudicata*, as well as the liability of the procedural substitute.

The conclusion of the monograph summarizes exhaustively all of the author’s conclusions in the analysis of the aforementioned legal institute.

#### 4.2. The overall assessment of monographs as follows:

The monograph „Procedural substitution in civil proceedings“ authored by Assoc. Prof. Todor Kolarov, Dr. Habil. is a complete and comprehensive research in the field of civil procedure law. It is independently completed. The originality of the tabled research is beyond doubt. The monograph is devoted to a topical and extremely important contemporary theme, which stands out with its specificity and complexity.

Of particular value and usefulness are the performed scientific analyses founded on numerous bibliographical sources as well as the extensive interpretative practice of the Supreme Court of Cassation. They demonstrate not only profound theoretical competence of the author but also an in-depth practical one, which are of essence for the better understanding of the theoretical matter under study.

The assiduously prepared scientific study, performed with precision and thoroughness, contains major groups of issues associated with procedural substitution in civil proceedings. Without doubt, the conclusions enrich contemporary theory. They demonstrate the aptitude to establish the nexus between scientific research and judicial practice. The scientific discussion on the pages of the monograph contributes to the comprehension of the legal reality and contributes to the professional efforts for its improvement. The author actively polemizes with various legal positions. The discussion is held in a dynamic manner. The legal institute of procedural substitution under review is analyzed in an extremely intriguing manner. The theoretical research is an interesting doctrinal reading which has high scientific and practical value.

As far as the institute of procedural substitution is applicable in the administrative process on the basis of art. 144 Administrative Procedure Code, which introduces subsidiary application of CPC, I find that the significance of the matter under discussion exceeds the scope of civil procedure law and has value in the Administrative Procedure Law. Thus, in conclusion I shall put an emphasis on the general usefulness of the research for the legal theory.

The scientific contributions of the monograph “Procedural substitution in civil procedure” are more than few. The more important ones are:

4.2.1. In almost all parts of the theoretical review the author discusses the significance of legal interest in the application of this institute. To me, the discussion on the legal interest in various aspects is a contribution on its own.

4.2.2. In this regard, of prominence for the legal theory is the actualization of Prof. Jivko Stalev’s classification in his remarkable study “Res iudicata in civil proceedings” on what could be the bases for the legal interest of the procedural substitute, due to legislative amendments.

4.2.3. The distinction between procedural substitution and procedural representation has contributive character.

4.2.4. The discussion on the position of the prosecutor, who may participate in civil proceedings in the instances provided in the legislation with rights of a party. This matter is of particular topicality for the administrative procedure legislation, due to the fact that recent amendments to the Constitution of the Republic of Bulgaria abrogated the competence of the prosecutor to exercise administrative control over challenges to individual and general administrative acts before the body in the position of immediate superiority.

4.2.5. As a proficient expert on the matter, the author adroitly elaborates the position that CEPACA is not a procedural substitute in the asset confiscation proceedings.

4.2.6. Of particular importance for the legal theory is the in-depth analysis of the protected legal interest in actions under art. 94, art. 95-95B Copyright and Similar Rights Act, art. 71 Protection against Discrimination Act and art. 186 Consumer Protection Act.

4.2.7. *De lege ferenda* are a stand-alone contribution of practical and theoretical character.

5. Description and evaluation of the other publications in specialized scientific publications in the field of the competition, which do not repeat those presented for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree "Ph.D." and their scientific contributions

Associate Professor Todor Kolarov participated in the current competition with the following other publications, the contributions of which I fully acknowledge, as indicated by him:

5.1. Historic analogs of civil confiscation of unexplained wealth – the case of Bulgaria. *Journal of Financial Crime*, Vol. 27, 2020, No. 2, pp. 561-571. The originality of the study lies in the author's discussion of the theoretical basis of asset forfeiture legislation in a continental legal system country, which is a contribution to the ongoing debate about the compatibility of asset forfeiture of unexplained wealth with the continental legal tradition.

5.2. Challenges in settling non-conviction based civil confiscation of unexplained wealth. *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, Vol. 24, 2021, No. 3, pp. 483-490. The contribution of the article consists in identifying some doctrinal and practical complications, both nationally and internationally, arising from the judicial settlement of cases of forfeiture of unexplained wealth in the civil process, which does not require a final judgment. Furthermore, the article makes recommendations *de lege ferenda*.

5.3. International commercial arbitrator addressing money laundering *sua sponte*. *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, Vol. 25, 2022, No. 3, pp. 637-644. This article sets out to assess the existing legal framework governing the arbitrator's power to raise *ex officio* the issue of simulation with the purpose to disguise money laundering in arbitration proceedings, as well as its practical application. Its originality finds expression in the discussion of the theoretical and practical aspects related to money laundering through simulated arbitration proceedings. In addition, it makes proposals *de lege ferenda* addressed to the 2012 Recommendations of the Financial Action Task Force against money laundering.

5.4. Legal professionals' effectiveness as anti-money laundering "gatekeepers". In: Peráček, T and Castro Moreira, F (eds.) *DOCTRINA ET USU IN BUSINESS LAW*. Bucharest, Paris, Calgary: Adjuris, 2023, pp. 163-174. The purpose of this research is to assess the effectiveness of lawyers and notaries, as designated non-financial businesses and professions (DNFBPs), in preventing the placement phase of money laundering. Based on empirical data collected by a target group of lawyers and notaries from three European Union member states, namely Bulgaria, Spain and Italy, using the inductive method, conclusions are drawn about the effectiveness of their role as "gatekeepers" of the financial system specifically in the identification of the ultimate beneficial owner and other indicators of money laundering, particularly in the case of money laundering through commercial transactions. The contribution

of the study is the evaluation based on empirical analysis of the potential of lawyers and notaries, in their capacity as certain DNFBPs, to prevent the entry of money of criminal origin into the financial system.

My overall assessment regarding the content of the additional 4 articles and studies of the candidate in the competition testify to the highest possible degree of professional and scientific qualification achieved by Todor Kolarov, Dr. Habil., to the extent that he examines extensively, thoroughly and with great expertise a wide range of confiscation issues in civil proceedings, case settlement in forfeiture of unexplained wealth proceedings; money laundering through simulated arbitration proceedings; discussion of the essential role of lawyers and notaries, in their capacity as certain DNFBPS, to prevent the entry of money of criminal origin into the financial system. These efforts of his undoubtedly enriched the civil law doctrine.

#### 6. Fulfillment of minimum national and additional scientometric requirements

6.1. (A) Dissertation for the award of the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" - Judicial cooperation among EU Member States in combating transnational organized crime. PU "Paisiy Hilendarski". 241 pages – **50 p.**

6.2. (B) Doctor of Science Dissertation - Security in EU Mixed Agreements. NBU. 308 pages – **100 p.**

6.3. (C) Habilitation work - monograph - Procedural substitution in the civil process. Sofia: Ciela. 2023. ISBN: 978-954-28-4420-4, 246 ctp. - **100 p.**

6.4. (D) Articles and reports published in scientific publications, indexed and referenced in world-renowned databases of scientific information

6.4.1. Historic analogs of civil confiscation of unexplained wealth – the case of Bulgaria. *Journal of Financial Crime*. Vol. 27, No. 2, 2020. pp. 561-571. ISSN 1359-0790 (Scopus indexed, second quartile in law) – **30 p.**

6.4.2. Challenges in settling non-conviction based civil confiscation of unexplained wealth. *Journal of Money Laundering Control*. Vol. 24, 2021, No. 3, pp. 483-490. ISSN 1368-5201 (Scopus indexed, second quartile in law and Web of Science indexed) – **30 p.**

6.4.3. International commercial arbitrator addressing money laundering *sua sponte*, *Journal of Money Laundering Control*. Vol. 25, 2022, No. 3, pp. 637-644. ISSN 1368-5201 – **30 p.**

6.5. (E) Articles and reports published in edited collective volumes

6.5.1. Legal professionals' effectiveness as anti-money laundering "gatekeepers". In: PERACEK, Tomas. & MOREIRA, Fátima Castro (Eds.) *Doctrina et Usu in Business Law*, 2023, pp.163-174. ISBN 9786069535165 (E-Book) – **10 p.**

6.6. (F) Citations or reviews in scientific publications, indexed and referenced in world-renowned databases of scientific information or monographs and collective volumes:

6.6.1. KOLAROV, Todor. Challenges in settling non-conviction based civil confiscation of unexplained wealth. *Journal of Money Laundering Control*. Vol. 24 No. 3. 2021. pp. 483-490. ISSN 1368-5201, *cited in* RAHMAN, Aspalella. An analysis of the forfeiture regime under the anti-money laundering law. *Journal of Money Laundering Control*. Vol. 25 No. 1, 2022. pp. 50-62, 56. ISSN 1368-5201 – **15 p.**

6.6.2. KOLAROV, Todor. International commercial arbitrator addressing money laundering *sua sponte*, *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, Vol. 25 No. 3, 2022. pp. 637-644. ISSN 1368-5201, *cited in* TEICHMANN, Fabian. BOTICIU, Sonia Ruxandra and SERGI,

Bruno S. Compliance issues in arbitration proceedings – bribery, money laundering and other abuses, *Journal of Financial Crime*, Vol. ahead-of-print No. ahead-of-print. 2023. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JFC-10-2022-0241> – **15 p.**

6.7. (F) Citations in peer-reviewed monographs and collective volumes

6.7.1. KOLAROV, Todor, Atanas RUSEV. Executive summary (pp. 7-11), Chapter 1 (pp. 11-13), Chapter 2 (pp. 13-23), Chapter 3 (pp. 23-33), Chapter 5 (45-51) and following country profiles: Austria (pp. 51-52), Bulgaria (pp. 54-57), Czech Republic (pp. 59-61), Finland (pp. 66-68), Germany (pp. 70-72), Greece (pp. 72-74), Hungary (pp. 74-76), Malta (pp. 85-86), Poland (pp. 88-90), Romania (pp. 92-94), Slovakia (pp. 94-97), Slovenia (pp. 97-99), Sweden (pp. 101-103). In: *Disposal of Confiscated Assets in EU Member States, Laws and Practices*. Sofia: CSD, 2014. ISBN 9789544772185, *cited in* SLINGENEYER, Tibaut. *Management of frozen assets*. In: *Improving Confiscation Procedures in the European Union*. Napoli: Jovene, 2019, pp. 547-564. 547, 548, 550, 552, 553, 555, 563. ISBN 9788824326155 – **5 p.**

6.7.2. KOLAROV, Todor, Atanas RUSEV. Executive summary (pp. 7-11), Chapter 1 (pp. 11-13), Chapter 2 (pp. 13-23), Chapter 3 (pp. 23-33), Chapter 5 (45-51) and following country profiles: Austria (pp. 51-52), Bulgaria (pp. 54-57), Czech Republic (pp. 59-61), Finland (pp. 66-68), Germany (pp. 70-72), Greece (pp. 72-74), Hungary (pp. 74-76), Malta (pp. 85-86), Poland (pp. 88-90), Romania (pp. 92-94), Slovakia (pp. 94-97), Slovenia (pp. 97-99), Sweden (pp. 101-103). In: *Disposal of Confiscated Assets in EU Member States, Laws and Practices*. Sofia: CSD, 2014. ISBN 9789544772185, *cited in* BERRUTI, Gilda. *URBANISMO INFORMAL Y EQUIPAMIENTOS TERRITORIALES. LA REUTILIZACIÓN DE LOS BIENES CONFISCADOS A LAS MAFIAS COMO RESPUESTA A LAS VULNERABILIDADES DE LOS TERRITORIOS // GONZALEZ GARCÍA, I. MAZZA, A. NELLO, O. HERNÁNDEZ AJA, A. MOCCIA, F. D. ARENA, A. BERRUTI, G. CARMONA MATEOS, F. COPPOLA, E. CÓRDOBA HERNÁNDEZ, R. FERNÁNDEZ RAMÍREZ, C. GAYOSO HEREDIA, M. FRANCESE, D. GÓMEZ GIMÉNEZ, J. M. DE JOANNA, P. LAINO, G. MORÁN ALONSO, N. NIGRO, A. NÚÑEZ PEIRÓ, M. PACIELLO, R. ROMÁN, E. SÁNCHEZ-GUEVARA, C. SÁNCHEZ-TOSCANO, G. SANZ FERNÁNDEZ, A. SIMÓN ROJO, M. SGOBBO, A. TRUPIANO, G. Territorios segregados y (des)gobernanza urbana. Nápoles/Madrid/Barcelona. 2021. pp. 66, ISBN 9788497285926 – **5 p.***

6.7.3. KOLAROV, Todor. *Judicial cooperation among EU Member States in combating transnational organized crime*. Sofia: Ciela, 2012. ISBN 9789542811596, *cited in* KOSTADINOVA, Ralitsa. *Conditional sentencing under Bulgarian criminal law*. Sofia: NBU, 2019, p. 218. ISBN 9786192330682 – **10 p.**

6.7.4. KOLAROV, Todor. *Judicial cooperation among EU Member States in combating transnational organized crime*. Sofia: Ciela, 2012. ISBN 9789542811596, *cited in* VALCHEVA, Aleksandra and HRISTOZOVA, Maria. *Legal regulation of judicial cooperation in civil and criminal cases in the European Union*, in: Tsvetanov, Ivan *et al.* (ed.) *Collection of reports from the scientific conference "100 years of UNWE - 100 years of law in UNWE"*. pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 – **10 p.**

6.7.5. KOLAROV, TODOR. *EU Mixed Agreements*. Sofia: NBU. 2018. ISBN 9786192330125, *cited in* GEORGIEV, Vasil. *EU common foreign and security policy - evolution, interactions, opportunities*. Plovdiv: VUSI. 2021, p. 259. ISBN 786197343441 – **10 p.**

6.7.6. KOLAROV, TODOR. EU Mixed Agreements. Sofia: NBU. 2018. ISBN 9786192330125, cited in YOCHEVA, Katerina. European citizens' initiative. Sofia: Avangard Prima. 2022. p. 120. ISBN 9786192397661 – **10 p.**

6.7.7. KOLAROV, Todor. Historic analogs of civil confiscation of unexplained wealth – the case of Bulgaria. *Journal of Financial Crime*, Vol. 27, 2020, No. 2, pp. 561-571. ISSN 1359-0790, *cited in* YORDANOVA, Gergana. Hawala – Essence. Typologies of money laundering and terrorist financing and proliferation. Sofia: Institute for National and International Security Foundation. 2023. ISBN 9786197143140. p. 160. – **10 p.**

6.7.8. KOLAROV, Todor. Historic analogs of civil confiscation of unexplained wealth – the case of Bulgaria. *Journal of Financial Crime*, Vol. 27, 2020, No. 2, pp. 561-571. ISSN 1359-0790, *cited in* VALCHEVA, Aleksandra and HRISTOZOVA, Maria. Legal regulation of judicial cooperation in civil and criminal cases in the European Union, in: Tsvetanov, Ivan et al. (ed.) Collection of reports from the scientific conference "100 years of UNWE - 100 years of law in UNWE". pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 Vol. 2, Sofia: UNWE. 2021, pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 – **10 p.**

6.7.9. KOLAROV, Todor. Challenges in settling non-conviction based civil confiscation of unexplained wealth. *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, Vol. 24, 2021, No. 3, pp. 483-490. ISSN 1368-5201 *cited in* VALCHEVA, Aleksandra and HRISTOZOVA, Maria. Legal regulation of judicial cooperation in civil and criminal cases in the European Union, in: Tsvetanov, Ivan et al. (ed.) Collection of reports from the scientific conference "100 years of UNWE - 100 years of law in UNWE". pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 Vol. 2, Sofia: UNWE. 2021, pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 – **10 p.**

6.7.10. KOLAROV, Todor. Seizing and confiscating criminal property under EU law. *Teza*, 2011, No. 1, *cited in* PANAYOTOV, Spas. The new provisions in Art. 53 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Bulgaria. in: Tsvetanov, Ivan et al. (ed.) Collection of reports from the scientific conference "100 years of UNWE - 100 years of law in UNWE". Vol. 2. pp. 337-345, 338. ISBN 9786192324384 – **10 p.**

6.7.11. KOLAROV, Todor. Mutual Recognition of Judicial Decisions on Confiscation: The Way Forward. in: Doikov, N. (ed.) *Modern security and modern technologies*, volume 2. Sofia: NTSM "Industria 4-0", 2019, pp. 397-403. ISBN: 9786197383133, *cited in* VALCHEVA, Aleksandra and HRISTOZOVA, Maria. Legal regulation of judicial cooperation in civil and criminal cases in the European Union, in: Tsvetanov, Ivan et al. (ed.) Collection of reports from the scientific conference "100 years of UNWE - 100 years of law in UNWE". pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 Vol. 2, Sofia: UNWE. 2021, pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 – **10 p.**

6.7.12. KOLAROV, Todor. Awaiting a new legislative initiative of the European Commission on the recognition of judicial acts for securing and confiscation. *European Law Review*, Vol XVI, 2016, 24. ISSN 1314-4847, *cited in* VALCHEVA, Aleksandra and HRISTOZOVA, Maria. Legal regulation of judicial cooperation in civil and criminal cases in the European Union, in: Tsvetanov, Ivan et al. (ed.) Collection of reports from the scientific conference "100 years of UNWE - 100 years of law in UNWE". pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 Vol. 2, Sofia: UNWE. 2021, pp. 205-218, 213. ISBN 9786192324384 – **10 p.**

6.7.13. KOLAROV, Todor. The Islamic headscarf in the workplace and justified state intervention. in: *Europe: Global Threats and Integrated Security. Security in the Black Sea Region: Collection of scientific papers*, Sofia: NTSM "Industria-4.0", 2017. ISBN 9786197383072, *cited in* DIMITROV, Michael. The Western Balkans in the battle for the Rimland. - Sofia: NTSM "Industria - 4.0", 2022, p. 18. ISBN 9786197383249 – **10 p.**

6.7.14. KOLAROV, Todor. Application of Regulation (EC) No 44/2001. In: Summary of application of Regulation (EC) No 44/2001 in Romania and Bulgaria in light of the CJEU caselaw. Sofia: Sibi, 2016, pp. 11-34. ISBN 9789547309968, *cited in* SIDOVA, Dafinka. Cross-border cooperation, innovation, security. DOIKOV, Nenko (ed.). Modern security and modern technology. Collection of scientific reports from the International Scientific Conference, March 15, 2019, Vol. 1. Technologies in security, Sofia: NTSM "Industria 4.0", 2019 pp. 169-179, 171. ISBN 9786197383133. – **10 p.**

6.8. (F) Citations or reviews in non-refereed peer-reviewed scientific journals

6.8.1. KOLAROV, Todor. Challenges in settling non-conviction based civil confiscation of unexplained wealth. *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, Vol. 24, 2021, No. 3, pp. 483-490. ISSN 1368-5201, *cited in* YODI NUGRAHA, Muhamad. HAERANAH, Haeranah and AZISA, Nur. Confiscation of assets without a criminal decision in recovering state financial losses due to crime of corruption. *Legal brief*. 11(6). 2023, pp. 3480–3492. eISSN 2722-4643 – **5 p.**

6.8.2. KOLAROV, Todor. International commercial arbitrator addressing money laundering sua sponte. – *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, Vol. 25, 2022, No. 3, pp. 637-644. ISSN 1368-5201, *cited in* DIMITROV, Mihael M. Analysis of strategic stakeholders in the Western Balkans. *Security and Defence Quarterly*, 40 (4), 2022, pp. 27-46, 28. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.35467/sdq/154884>. ISSN 2300-8741 - **5 p.**

6.8.3. KOLAROV, Todor. International commercial arbitrator addressing money laundering sua sponte. – *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, Vol. 25, 2022, No. 3, pp. 637-644. ISSN 1368-5201, *cited in* KUCHUMOV, A. V. PECHERITZA, E. V. Definition of money laundering (legalization): substance and legal aspects. *Economic vector*. 3 (30), 2022, pp. 115-122, 119. DOI: 10.36807/2411-7269-2022-3-30-115-122. ISSN 2411-7269 – **5 p.**

6.8.4. KOLAROV, Todor. Historic analogs of civil confiscation of unexplained wealth – the case of Bulgaria. *Journal of Financial Crime*, Vol. 27, 2020, No. 2, pp. 561-571. ISSN 1359-0790, *cited in* DIMITROV, Mihael M. Analysis of strategic stakeholders in the Western Balkans. *Security and Defence Quarterly*, 40 (4), 2022, pp. 27-46, 28. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.35467/sdq/154884>. ISSN 2300-8741 - **5 p.**

6.8.5. KOLAROV, Todor. Judicial cooperation among EU member states in combating transnational organized crime. Sofia: Ciela, 2012. ISBN 9789542811596, *cited in* BANKOV, Stefcho. Fight against organized crime in Bulgaria. Legal problems and the need to improve the interaction between law enforcement agencies. International conference Knowledge-based organization. Vol. XXVI, 2020, No 1, pp. 14-21, 14. Online ISSN 2451-3113. – **5 p.**

6.8.6. KOLAROV, Todor. Enhancing national security by restricting human rights. V. KOLAROV Todor. (ed.). *Southeastern Europe: The New Threats in Regional Security*. Sofia: NBU, 2016, pp. 412-417. ISBN 9789545359071, *cited in* GEORGIEV, Vasil. The Responsibility to Protect Principle and the Actions of the International Community in Myanmar in 2017 - Politics and Security. Year II, 2018, № 4, c. 57-69, 67. ISSN 2535-0358. – **5 p.**

6.8.7. KOLAROV, Todor. Enhancing national security by restricting human rights. V. KOLAROV Todor. (ed.). *Southeastern Europe: The New Threats in Regional Security*. Sofia: NBU, 2016, pp. 412-417. ISBN 9789545359071, *cited in* HRISTOZOVA, Maria. Human Rights in Counter-Terrorism: The United Nations Security Council Sanctions Regime. – *Law Journal of the NBU*, 2019, № 1-3, pp. 35-42, 41. ISSN (Online) 1314-5797. - **5 p.**

6.9. (G) Acquisition of a scientific degree "Doctor of Sciences" - for an acquired scientific degree "Doctor of Sciences" in a professional direction 9.1. National Security was issued diploma No. 007/20.07.2018 by the NBU – **40 p.**

6.10. (G) Participation in international scientific or educational project:

6.10.1. “Promoting transparency and action against economic crime in Uzbekistan” (CA TAEC UZ) project of the Council of Europe. Framework contract number: CA TAEC-2021-TK-01. Duration: March 23, 2021 – April 23, 2021 r. Role: Consultant. The contract contains explicit confidentiality clause - **20 p.**

6.10.2. CEPOL TOPCOP project – (page of the project - <https://www.cepola.europa.eu/international-cooperation/topcop>). Engaged in three separate project components, of which only one CEPOL/EE/2020/209 is referred for the purposes of this assessment. The contract contains explicit confidentiality clause. Duration: December 10, 2020 – July 31, 2021. Role: Short Term Expert – **20 p.**

6.10.3. „Develop an assessment and analysis of the legal framework and operational practices of the countries covered in RP for Afghanistan and neighboring countries, as per ToR” UN project (UNODC more specifically). Contract number 5821, duration April 7, 2015 – August 10, 2015 r. Role: Consultant. The contract contains explicit confidentiality clause. – **20 p.**

6.11. (G) Published university manual - KOLAROV, Todor. LEKOVA, Tsvetelina and DAHLYANOVA, Ivelina. Handbook of civil procedural law. Sophia: Siella. 2022, ISBN: 9789542839392 – **6 p.**

Total points for National Scientometric Requirements (651 out of 550 required).

7.1. (H) Membership in a national and/or international organization and association in the relevant professional field - member of the Bulgarian Association of International Law – **10 p.**

7.2. (H) Participating in a research or creative project beyond those in 6.10:

7.2.1. Panelist in panel I.A– Migration and security challenges and the EU's response at the plenary session I: The Future of the EU at Trans European Policy Studies Association Bulgarian Pre-Presidency Conference, Sofia, 30 November - 1 December, 2017 – **10 p.**

7.2.2. Panelist in panel Mutual recognition of judicial decisions on confiscation: the way forward at the scientific conference Mutual recognition of judicial decisions and confiscation 15 years after Tampere: an additional tool for depriving criminals of their illicit assets all over the Union organized by the Italian Presidency of the European Council at Istituto Superiore di Scienze Criminali - ISISC, Siracusa, Italy on September 22-23, 2014 – **10 p.**

7.3. (H) Participation in the board/managing board of a national/international organization or association in the relevant professional field - Chairman of Regional Anti-Corruption Initiative (2018 – 2019) – **10 p.**

7.4. (H) Conducting public lectures on behalf of the NBU at the invitation of an academic institution or prestigious national/international organizations - an online lecture on "Money Laundering Techniques (in English)" was held on May 14, 2022 and lectures held in the period May 8-12, 2023 on "Money Laundering Techniques and the Legal Profession (in English)" in Erasmus+ teaching mobility format at the invitation of the host institution Neapolis University Pafos, Cyprus – **10 p.**

7.5. (H) Actively involved in the creation of a successfully launched new program - participation in the successful launch Political Science (in English) program, with two courses

offered POLS317 EU Development Policies and POLS436 Security in Europe: Dangers, Risks, Countermeasures. (The above is reported after receiving the express approval not only from Associate Professor Staykova, Head of the Department of Political Sciences, but also of Prof. Evgeni Dainov.) – **15 p.**

7.6. (H) Participation in the improvement of the program and the development of courses for the program - participation in the improvement of the master's programs in the Department of "National and International Security", with the changes reflected in the 2023/2024 catalog, including the rationalization and development of the courses led by the candidate – **10 p.**

7.7. (H) He organized and held a scientific conference at the NBU - initiator of the international scientific conference "Rights and Security" (April 27-28, 2023 г.) – **20 p.**

7.8. (H) Possesses proven professional applied skills in the relevant scientific field and professional direction - nominated for "Lawyer of the Year" - 2022 in the "Justice abroad" category - **20 p.**

7.9. (I) Average Student Satisfaction Score Above 4.00 - The average score from student surveys over the last ten semesters is 4.53/5.00 - **10 p.**

7.10. (I) Published author's materials for at least one course in book form or Moodle - KOLAROV, Todor. LEKOVA, Tsvetelina and DAHLYANOVA, Ivelina. Handbook of civil procedural law. Sofia: Ciela. 2022, as well as author's materials in electronic form in Moodle – **20 p.**

7.11. (I) Advisory to graduates who successfully defended their diplomas and participation in state examination boards - for the academic year 2022/2023 alone, participation in 4 state examination boards, two in each "National and International Security" Department and the "Law" Department. In each of the mentioned departments, once as a member and once as a chairman of an examination committee – **80 p.**

7.12. (I) Courses taught in foreign language – see p. G.30 – **20 p.**

7.13. (J) Participation as a trainee in a training program for the teaching and administrative staff of the NBU - participation in training on the functionality of the StrikePlagiarism software (2023) – **10 p.**

7.14. (J) The candidate performs his academic duties – **10 p.**

7.15. (J) Participation in projects for which external funds are attracted to the NBU - during the annual scientific conference of the Department of "National and International Security" under the title "Southeastern Europe: The new threats to regional security (June 2-3, 2015) secured funding from Embassy of the United States for the participation of Janusz Bugajski as a keynote speaker at the conference – **20 p.**

7.16. (K). Participation in the Program, Faculty or Academic Council - member of the Faculty Council of the School of Distance, Digital and Continuing Education and the Academic Council of NBU – **30 p.**

7.17. (K) Participation in the academic administration of the NBU - Head of the "National and International Security" Department, and in the period October 12, 2015 – March 1, 2017. Program consultant in the same department – **25 p.**

7.18. (K) The candidate has no disciplinary sanctions under the Labor Code – **10 p.**

Total, according to the additional indicators and requirements of the NBU: **380 points**

8. Competition data

8.1. On 17.05.2023, pursuant to art. 64, para. 3 of the Ordinance on the Development of the Academic Staff of NBU, Associate Professor Todor Kolarov gave a public lecture on the topic "Procedural substitution in the civil process", which I attended and which emphasized the peculiarities of the discussed legal institute.

8.2. In "State Gazette", no. 94 of 10.11.2023. New Bulgarian University announces a competition for the academic position of "professor" in the field of higher education: 3. Social, economic and legal sciences by professional direction: 3.6. Law (Civil Procedure Law).

8.3. Pursuant to art. 4 and art. 25 of the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria (LDASRB); Art. 57, para. 1-2 of the Regulations for the implementation of the LDASRB; Decision No. 5 of 23.01.2024 of the Academic Council of the NBU with order No. 3-PK-86/23.01.2024 of the Rector of the New Bulgarian University Prof. Plamen Doinov, Dr. Habil. I have been appointed as a titular internal member of a scientific jury in the announced competition for the academic position of "professor" in the professional direction: 3.6. Law (Civil Procedure Law) at the NBU. In the thus announced competition, application for participation in the present procedure No. 1/20.12.2023 was submitted by the only candidate, Associate Professor Todor Panaiotov Kolarov.

8.4. At the absentee first meeting of the scientific jury in the announced competition for the occupation of the academic position "professor" by professional direction 3.6. Law (Civil Procedural Law) on 24.01.2024 the following decisions were adopted:

a) On the basis of art. 4, para. 8, item 1 of the LDASRB, I was unanimously elected as the chairman of the scientific jury.

b) On the basis of Art. 4, para. 8, item 2 of the LDASRB the only candidate in the competition for the academic position of "professor" in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, in a professional direction 3.6. Law (Civil Procedural Law) Associate Professor Todor Panaiotov Kolarov was admitted to assessment in accordance with the requirements of art. 3, para. 4 of LDASRB and art. 64, para. 2- 4 Ordinance on the Development of the Academic Staff of the NBU.

b) I was appointed as a reviewer in my capacity as an internal titular member of the scientific jury.

#### Conclusion

On the basis of the Law on the Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria, art. 60 – 61 of the Regulations for the Implementation of the LDASRB, art. 64 of the Ordinance on the Development of the Academic Staff of the NBU and the documents and evidence submitted in the competition, I give the following assessment for the candidate, Associate Professor Todor Panaiotov Kolarov:

1. has an educational and scientific degree "doctor" in the same specialty as the announced competition;

2. held the academic position of "Associate Professor" for 9 years in the same university and during that time he held lectures, being a prominent specialist in practice with proven achievements in the field of civil procedural law;

3. submitted a published monographic work "Procedural substitution in the civil procedure" from the field of the competition, which does not repeat the publications submitted

for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree "Ph.D.";

4. has presented 4 other publications in specialized scientific publications in the field of the competition with significant scientific contributions, which are not repeated with those presented for the acquisition of the educational and scientific degree "Ph.D.";

5. meets the minimum national requirements of art. 2b of LDASRB for scientific field 3. "Social, economic and legal sciences", professional direction 3.6. "Law" (651 out of 550 required points) and the additional requirements of New Bulgarian University (380 points);

6. there is no proven plagiarism in his scientific works in accordance with the law.

My personal impressions of Associate Professor Todor Kolarov are that he is an extremely competent professional. Each of his scientific works is subject to great thoroughness and comprehensiveness. The theoretical works submitted for review only confirm the high assessment I give to the candidate's scientific work in the competition. It is filled with a significant number of doctrinal contributions, which are highly valued by the legal community in Bulgaria and abroad, as can be seen from the citation data presented. Associate Professor Todor Kolarov is one of the few representatives of the legal college of university professors who have published their research in scientific publications, indexed and referenced in world-renowned databases of scientific information. Outside of narrow scientific pursuits, I can say that Associate Professor Todor Kolarov is an excellent university teacher who adheres to academic ethics and professionalism to the highest degree. In his attitude towards students, he shows great respect both for them as individuals and for their efforts in the educational process. The objective evaluation of the students' knowledge is proven by the high values given to the lecture courses led by him during the last ten semesters (reflected in item 7.9) and by the successes they achieve in the field of civil process after completing the "Law" specialty at NBU. In his collegial relations, Prof. Kolarov is correct and well-intentioned. The candidate's contribution to the positive development of NBU as a leading national academic and scientific center is expressed both in the many projects, initiatives, events that he has organized and in which he actively participated, as well as in the creation of new programs, new courses, the scientific leadership of doctoral students and the co-authorship of a textbook to help students in civil procedural law.

Bearing in mind the above, I find that the candidacy of Associate Professor Todor Panaiotov Kolarov corresponds to the national minimum requirements and the additional requirements of New Bulgarian University, which apply for the academic position of "Professor". On this basis, I present my **positive** review regarding the candidate in the competition, proposing that the Academic Council of the New Bulgarian University elect Todor Panaiotov Kolarov, Associate Professor, Dr. Habil., to the academic position of "Professor" in the field of higher education 3. Social, economic and legal sciences, in a professional direction 3.6. Law (Civil Procedure Law).

March 14, 2024

Reviewer:

Prof. Rayna Nikolova, Dr. Habil.  
NBU teacher